

Ashley M. Simonsen (State Bar. No. 275203)
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP
1999 Avenue of the Stars
Los Angeles, CA 90067
Telephone: + 1 (424) 332-4800
Facsimile: +1 (650) 632-4800
Email: asimonsen@cov.com

Michael X. Imbroscio, *pro hac vice*
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP
One CityCenter
850 Tenth Street, NW
Washington, DC 20001-4956
Telephone: + 1 (202) 662-6000
Facsimile: + 1 (202) 662-6291
Email: mimbroscio@cov.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Meta Platforms, Inc.
f/k/a Facebook, Inc.; Facebook Holdings, LLC;
Facebook Operations, LLC; Facebook
Payments, Inc.; Facebook Technologies, LLC;
Instagram, LLC; and Siculus, Inc.*

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
OAKLAND DIVISION**

IN RE: SOCIAL MEDIA ADOLESCENT
ADDICTION/PERSONAL INJURY PRODUCTS
LIABILITY LITIGATION

THIS FILING RELATES TO:

ALL ACTIONS

MDL No. 3047

Case No. 4:22-md-03047-YGR

**STIPULATION ON SEALING ORDER
RESOLVING DISPUTE REGARDING
PRIVILEGE DETERMINATION IN
CONNECTION WITH DEPOSITION OF
MIKI ROTHSCILD**

Judge: Hon. Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers
Magistrate Judge: Hon. Peter H. Kang

Pursuant to the Court’s Order Resolving Dispute Regarding Privilege Determination in Connection with Deposition of Miki Rothschild (“Order”) (ECF 1478), Defendants Meta Platforms, Inc. f/k/a Facebook, Inc.; Facebook Holdings, LLC; Facebook Operations, LLC; Facebook Payments, Inc.; Facebook Technologies, LLC; Instagram, LLC; and Siculus, Inc. (collectively, “Meta”) and Plaintiffs submit this Stipulation on Sealing Order Resolving Dispute Regarding Privilege Determination in Connection with Deposition of Miki Rothschild.

The Court ordered the Parties to meet and confer, reach agreement, and file a joint stipulation and proposed order regarding “which portions of [the] Order can be unredacted.” Order at 12. As elaborated on below, the Parties agree that the Order itself can be unsealed, except for one redaction of a Meta employee’s name to protect the employee’s privacy interests. The Parties agree that Meta’s Exhibits A and C should remain under seal and that Exhibit B may be unsealed except that Meta employees’ names and email addresses should be redacted—all of which the Court has already ordered sealed or redacted (and, of course, including privilege redactions that the Court upheld).

First, the Parties agree that the Order can be unsealed, except for the name of one Meta employee that appears at page 10, line 25. The Parties’ prior Omnibus Stipulation Regarding Sealing Joint Letter Brief Regarding Privilege Determination in Connection with Deposition of Miki Rothschild (ECF 1461) sought to seal that employee’s name in the briefing and exhibits, and the Court granted that request. *See* ECF 1465 at 2. As that stipulation explained, there is good cause to seal that information. *See, e.g., Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.*, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012) (Gonzalez Rogers, J.) (granting motion to seal “employee-identifying information” because “[e]mployees and former employees who are not parties to this litigation have privacy interests in their personnel information, and in other sensitive identifying information”); *see also, e.g., Am. Auto. Ass’n of N. California, Nevada & Utah v. Gen. Motors LLC*, 2019 WL 1206748, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 14, 2019); *Opperman v. Path, Inc.*, 2017 WL 1036652, at *4 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 17, 2017); *Hunt v. Cont’l Cas. Co.*, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015). Sealing this name is also consistent with the approach the Court took in sealing names of Meta employees in the Personal Injury Plaintiffs’ Master Complaint and the multistate Attorney General Complaint. *See* Dkt. 189; Case No. 4:23-cv-05448-YGR, Dkt. 77.

Second, the Parties are not certain whether the Order required taking a position on further sealing

1 of the three exhibits attached to the Order (as opposed to only the Order itself). Out of an abundance of
2 caution, the Parties provide their agreed position about sealing those documents.

3 The Parties have already stipulated to seal Meta’s Exhibits A (ECF 1478-1) and C (ECF 1478-3),
4 and the Court granted that request. *See* ECF 1465, 1461 at 2–3. The Parties therefore agree that the
5 versions of those exhibits that the Court included with the Order should be maintained under seal. As
6 explained in the prior stipulation and the declaration filed with it, the information contained in those
7 exhibits is proprietary, confidential, and could cause Meta competitive harm if disclosed. *See* ECF 1461
8 at 2–3; ECF 1461-2 (declaration). At this procedural posture, there is good cause to seal. *See, e.g., Ctr.*
9 *for Auto Safety v. Chrysler Grp., LLC*, 809 F.3d 1092, 1097 (9th Cir. 2016) (even under heightened
10 compelling-reasons standard, it is appropriate to seal “business information that might harm a litigant’s
11 competitive standing” (cleaned up)); *In re Elec. Arts, Inc.*, 298 F. App’x 568, 569 (9th Cir. 2008) (sealing
12 “confidential and commercially sensitive information”); *Prescott v. Reckitt Benckiser LLC*, 2023 WL
13 2465778, at *4 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 9, 2023) (sealing “household penetration rates” and defendant’s “target
14 consumer demographics”); *Cont’l Auto. Sys., Inc. v. Avanci, LLC*, 2019 WL 6612012, at *4 (N.D. Cal.
15 Dec. 5, 2019) (sealing “number of customers using Plaintiff’s products”).

16 The Parties have already stipulated to redact the employee names and email addresses in Meta’s
17 Exhibit B (ECF 1478-2) and the Court granted that request. *See* ECF 1465, 1461 at 4. The Parties agree
18 that those same redactions should apply to the version of Exhibit B that the Court included with the Order.
19 *See* ECF 1461 at 4; *supra* page 1. The Parties agree that Exhibit B does not otherwise need to be sealed
20 or redacted.

21 Documents without privilege redactions were never filed on the docket (and instead were lodged
22 with the Court for *in camera* review). As a result, unsealing the excerpts redacted for privilege is not at
23 issue currently.

24 Pursuant to the Court’s Order, the Parties attach versions of the Order and Exhibit B that are
25 unsealed except for the agreed proposed redactions. The Parties also submit a Proposed Order on this
26 stipulation.

27 **IT IS SO STIPULATED AND AGREED.**

1 DATED: January 21, 2025

Respectfully submitted,

2
3 **COVINGTON & BURLING LLP**

4 /s/ Ashley M. Simonsen
5 Michael X. Imbroscio, *pro hac vice*
6 COVINGTON & BURLING LLP
7 One CityCenter
8 850 Tenth Street, NW
9 Washington, DC 20001-4956
10 Telephone: + 1 (202) 662-6000
11 Facsimile: + 1 (202) 662-6291
12 Email: mimbrosco@cov.com

13
14 Ashley M. Simonsen (State Bar. No. 275203)
15 COVINGTON & BURLING LLP
16 1999 Avenue of the Stars
17 Los Angeles, CA 90067
18 Telephone: + 1 (424) 332-4800
19 Facsimile: +1 (650) 632-4800
20 Email: asimonsen@cov.com

21
22 Gregory L. Halperin, *pro hac vice*
23 COVINGTON & BURLING LLP
24 620 Eighth Avenue
25 New York, NY 10018-1405
26 Telephone: +1 (212) 841-1000
27 Facsimile: +1 (212) 841-1010
28 Email: ghalperin@cov.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Meta Platforms, Inc. f/k/a
Facebook, Inc.; Facebook Holdings, LLC; Facebook
Operations, LLC; Facebook Payments, Inc.; Facebook
Technologies, LLC; Instagram, LLC; and Siculus, Inc.*

22 /s/ Lexi J. Hazam
23 LEXI J. HAZAM
24 **LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &
25 BERNSTEIN, LLP**
26 275 Battery Street, 29th Floor San
27 Francisco, CA 94111-339 Telephone: 415-
28 956-1000

PREVIN WARREN
MOTLEY RICE LLC
401 9th Street NW Suite 630

1 Washington DC 20004
2 Telephone: 202-386-9610 pwarren@motleyrice.com

3 Co-Lead Counsel

4 CHRISTOPHER A. SEEGER
5 **SEEGER WEISS, LLP**
6 55 Challenger Road, 6th floor Ridgefield
7 Park, NJ 07660 Telephone: 973-639-9100
8 Facsimile: 973-679-8656 cseeger@seegerweiss.com

9 Counsel to Co-Lead Counsel and Settlement Counsel

10 JENNIE LEE ANDERSON
11 **ANDRUS ANDERSON, LLP**
12 155 Montgomery Street, Suite 900 San
13 Francisco, CA 94104 Telephone: 415-986-1400
14 jenni@andrusanderson.com

15 Liaison Counsel

16 JOSEPH G. VANZANDT
17 **BEASLEY ALLEN CROW METHVIN PORTIS &**
18 **MILES, P.C.**
19 234 Commerce Street
20 Montgomery, AL 36103
21 Telephone: 334-269-2343
22 joseph.vanzandt@beasleyallen.com

23 EMILY C. JEFFCOTT
24 **MORGAN & MORGAN**
25 220 W. Garden Street, 9th Floor Pensacola,
26 FL 32502
27 Telephone: 850-316-9100
28 ejeffcott@forthepeople.com

Federal/State Liaison Counsel MATTHEW

BERGMAN
SOCIAL MEDIA VICTIMS LAW CENTER
821 Second Avenue, Suite 2100
Seattle, WA 98104
Telephone: 206-741-4862
matt@socialmediavictims.org

JAMES J. BILSBORROW
WEITZ & LUXENBERG, PC
700 Broadway

1 New York, NY 10003
2 Telephone: 212-558-5500
3 Facsimile: 212-344-5461
4 jbilborrow@weitzlux.com

5 PAIGE BOLDT
6 **WATTS GUERRA LLP**
7 4 Dominion Drive, Bldg. 3, Suite 100 San Antonio,
8 TX 78257
9 Telephone: 210-448-0500 PBoldt@WattsGuerra.com

10 THOMAS P. CARTMELL
11 **WAGSTAFF & CARTMELL LLP**
12 4740 Grand Avenue, Suite 300 Kansas City,
13 MO 64112
14 Telephone: 816-701 1100 tcartmell@wcllp.com

15 JAYNE CONROY
16 **SIMMONS HANLY CONROY, LLC**
17 112 Madison Ave, 7th Floor New York, NY
18 10016
19 Telephone: 917-882-5522 jconroy@simmonsfirm.com

20 SARAH EMERY
21 **HENDY JOHNSON VAUGHN EMERY, PSC**
22 2380 Grandview Drive Ft.
23 Mitchell, KY 41017
24 Telephone: 888-606-5297
25 semery@justicestartshere.com

26 CARRIE GOLDBERG
27 **C.A. GOLDBERG, PLLC**
28 16 Court St.
Brooklyn, NY 11241
Telephone: (646) 666-8908 carrie@cagoldberglaw.com

SIN-TING MARY LIU AYLSTOCK
WITKIN KREIS & OVERHOLTZ, PLLC
17 East Main Street, Suite 200
Pensacola, FL 32502
Telephone: 510-698-9566
mliu@awkolaw.com

JAMES MARSH
MARSH LAW FIRM PLLC
31 Hudson Yards, 11th floor New York, NY
10001-2170
Telephone: 212-372-3030

1 jamesmarsh@marshlaw.com

2 ANDRE MURA
3 **GIBBS LAW GROUP, LLP**
4 1111 Broadway, Suite 2100
5 Oakland, CA 94607
6 Telephone: 510-350-9717
7 amm@classlawgroup.com

8 HILLARY NAPPI
9 **HACH & ROSE LLP**
10 112 Madison Avenue, 10th Floor New York,
11 New York 10016
12 Telephone: 212.213.8311
13 hnappi@hrsclaw.com

14 EMMIE PAULOS
15 **LEVIN PAPANTONIO RAFFERTY**
16 316 South Baylen Street, Suite 600
17 Pensacola, FL 32502
18 Telephone: 850-435-7107
19 epaulos@levinlaw.com

20 RUTH THI RIZKALLA
21 **THE CARLSON LAW FIRM, P.C.**
22 1500 Rosecrans Ave., Ste. 500 Manhattan
23 Beach, CA 90266

24 ALEXANDRA WALSH
25 **WALSH LAW**
26 1050 Connecticut Ave, NW, Suite 500
27 Washington D.C. 20036
28 Telephone: 202-780-3014
awalsh@alexwalshlaw.com

MICHAEL M. WEINKOWITZ
LEVIN SEDRAN & BERMAN, LLP
510 Walnut Street
Suite 500
Philadelphia, PA 19106
Telephone: 215-592-1500 mweinkowitz@lfsbalw.com

MELISSA YEATES
JOSEPH H. MELTZER
KESSLER TOPAZ MELTZER & CHECK,
LLP
280 King of Prussia Road Radnor, PA
19087

1 Telephone: 610-667-7706
2 myeates@ktmc.com
3 jmeltzer@ktmc.com

4 DIANDRA “FU” DEBROSSE ZIMMERMANN
5 **DICELLO LEVITT**
6 505 20th St North Suite 1500
7 Birmingham, Alabama 35203
8 Telephone: 205.855.5700

9 *Attorneys for PI/SD Plaintiffs*

10 **PHILIP J. WEISER**
11 Attorney General State of
12 Colorado

13 /s/ Krista F. Batchelder

14 Krista F. Batchelder, CO Reg. No. 45066, *pro hac*
15 *vice*

16 Deputy Solicitor General

17 Lauren M. Dickey, CO Reg. No. 45773, *pro hac vice*

18 First Assistant Attorney General

19 Megan Paris Rundlet, CO Reg. No. 27474

20 Senior Assistant Solicitor General

21 Elizabeth Orem, CO Reg. No. 58309

22 Assistant Attorney General

23 Colorado Department of Law Ralph L. Carr

24 Judicial Center Consumer Protection

25 Section 1300 Broadway, 7th Floor Denver,
26 CO 80203

27 Phone: (720) 508-6651

28 bianca.miyata@coag.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Colorado, ex rel. Philip J.
Weiser, Attorney General*

ROB BONTA
Attorney General State of California

/s/ Megan O'Neill

Nicklas A. Akers (CA SBN 211222)

Senior Assistant Attorney General

Bernard Eskandari (SBN 244395)

Emily Kalanithi (SBN 256972)

Supervising Deputy Attorneys General

Nayha Arora (CA SBN 350467)

Megan O'Neill (CA SBN 343535)

Joshua Olszewski-Jubelirer (CA SBN 336428)

1 Marissa Roy (CA SBN 318773)
2 Brendan Ruddy (CA SBN 297896)

3 Deputy Attorneys General California Department of
4 Justice Office of the Attorney General
455 Golden Gate Ave., Suite 11000 San Francisco, CA
5 94102-7004 Phone: (415) 510-4400
6 Fax: (415) 703-5480
Megan.Oneill@doj.ca.gov

7 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the People of the State of*
8 *California*

9 **RUSSELL COLEMAN**

10 Attorney General Commonwealth of
Kentucky

11 /s/ Philip Heleringer

12 J. Christian Lewis (KY Bar No. 87109),
13 *Pro hac vice*
Philip Heleringer (KY Bar No. 96748),
14 *Pro hac vice*
Zachary Richards (KY Bar No. 99209),
15 *Pro hac vice*
Daniel I. Keiser (KY Bar No. 100264),
16 *Pro hac vice*
Matthew Cocanougher (KY Bar No. 94292),
17 *Pro hac vice*
Assistant Attorneys General
18 1024 Capital Center Drive, Suite 200
Frankfort, KY 40601
19 CHRISTIAN.LEWIS@KY.GOV
PHILIP.HELERINGER@KY.GOV
20 ZACH.RICHARDS@KY.GOV
DANIEL.KEISER@KY.GOV
21 MATTHEW.COCANOUGH@KY.GOV
22 Phone: (502) 696-5300
Fax: (502) 564-2698

23 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the Commonwealth of Kentucky*

24 **MATTHEW J. PLATKIN**

25 Attorney General

26 State of New Jersey

27 /s/ Thomas Huynh

28 Kashif T. Chand (NJ Bar No. 016752008),

Pro hac vice

Section Chief, Deputy Attorney General
Thomas Huynh (NJ Bar No. 200942017),

Pro hac vice

Assistant Section Chief, Deputy Attorney General
Verna J. Pradaxay (NJ Bar No. 335822021),

Pro hac vice

Mandy K. Wang (NJ Bar No. 373452021),

Pro hac vice

Deputy Attorneys General
New Jersey Office of the Attorney General,
Division of Law

124 Halsey Street, 5th Floor Newark, NJ 07101

Tel: (973) 648-2052

Kashif.Chand@law.njoag.gov

Thomas.Huynh@law.njoag.gov

Verna.Pradaxay@law.njoag.gov

Mandy.Wang@law.njoag.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff New Jersey Division of Consumer
Affairs*

ATTESTATION

I, Ashley M. Simonsen, hereby attest, pursuant to N.D. Cal. Civil L.R. 5-1, that the concurrence to the filing of this document has been obtained from each signatory hereto.

DATED: January 21, 2025

By: /s/ Ashley M. Simonsen
Ashley M. Simonsen